## THE JAINS IN THE COLONIAL WORLD: A REVIEW

## Paul Dundas

Andrea Luithle-Hardenberg, John E. Cort and Leslie Orr (eds.). Cooperation, Contribution and Contestation: The Jain Community, Colonialism and Scholarship, 1800-1950. Studies in Asian Art and Culture Vol. 6. Ed. Julia A.B. Hegewald. Berlin: EB-Verlag, 2020. ISBN: 978-3-86893-316-1. Hardcover, €69.00.

While no phase of Jainism's past can be regarded as fully transparent to modern scholarly scrutiny, the nineteenth century was until recently a particularly opaque period of Jain history.<sup>1</sup> This was no doubt partly the result of the prevailing preoccupation with "ancient" texts which for a long time dominated western research activity on Jainism, with the production of editions of Ardhamāgadhī canonical works and the elucidation of doctrine and exemplary narratives being the main focuses of scholarly work during the last quarter of the nineteenth century and the first half of the twentieth. The extensive archive sources, published and unpublished, both Indian and European, which could throw light on the commercial and religious activities of the Jains during the period of British colonialism were largely ignored by modern scholarship. Historians have only started to mine this material in recent decades, albeit, from the perspective of anyone interested in the recent Jain past, somewhat imperfectly. So in Bayly's classic study of South Asian trading communities during the hundred years in which British economic and political dominance was established, Jains as such make only fleeting appearances as exemplifications of the interplay between religious ethics and business practice, and they are generally subsumed throughout within the catch-all socially generic categories of mercantile class, group or family.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> John E. Cort, "Jain Society 1800-1947", in John E. Cort, Paul Dundas, Knut A. Jacobsen and Kristi Wiley (ed.), *Brill's Encyclopedia of Jainism*, Leiden / Boston: E. J. Brill, 2020, pp. 216-225, provides an authoritative survey of the current state of knowledge.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Christopher A. Bayly, Rulers, Townsmen and Bazaars. North Indian Society in the Age of British Expansion:

Although the substantial volume under review (henceforth CCC) has a great deal to say on the subject of the Jains as a business community during the "long" colonial century, its range is considerably wider. As reflected in the terms of its title, CCC examines the various ways in which the Jains cooperated in the early expansion of the colonial and subsequently globalised economy, contributed to the gathering and dissemination of information amongst Indologists about the long-lived religious tradition to which they belonged and vigorously contested the attempted encroachments of Christian missionaries on the integrity of their faith. Furthermore, CCC attempts to rehabilitate several officers of the East India Company and representatives of the British Raj along with a variety of "Orientalist" scholars whose work advanced critical understanding of the Jain community and its past.

CCC emerged from a research project initiated by Andrea Luithle-Hardenberg which focussed on the early nineteenth century British officer Alexander Walker of Bowland's unpublished manuscript on the Jains which was first described, albeit briefly, by Ernest Bender in 1976. An ensuing conference addressing the broader topic of the Jain community's diverse relations with the British during the "long" colonial century was held in Tübingen in 2010 from which the twelve papers contained in CCC emerged. They deploy to impressive effect a variety of perspectives hitherto largely regarded as incompatible in the study of Jainism: the religious and the economic, textual studies and ethnography, and the historical and the contemporary. These papers are grouped in three sections dealing respectively with European connections with the Jains in the nineteenth century and before (" Early British Encounters with the Jains: Colonialists, Orientalists and Missionaries"), Jain commercial activities in the colonial economy ("Jain Businessmen: Shaping Economic Success and Jain Identity") and western scholarly engagement with the Jain textual and intellectual tradition ("Later Indological Studies: European, American and Tamil Scholarship on the Jains"). There is a more marked editorial presence in CCC than might otherwise be expected, for apart from their own contributions (in Cort's case two) the three editors provide lengthy and thoughtful introductions to the volume as a whole ("Cooperation, Contribution and Contestation: The Jain Community, Colonialism and

<sup>1770-1870,</sup> Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983.

Jainological Scholarship 1800-1950") and to its individual sections along with a lengthy note on its illustrations ("Portraits and Power"). In what follows I will confine myself to commenting on the twelve non-editorial contributions to the volume.

In "European Imaginings of Jainism in Colonial Madras: Tales of the Coromandel Coast", Leslie C. Orr provides a detailed analysis of how in the early nineteenth century members of what Thomas Trautmann has called the "Madras School of Orientalism" were the first Europeans to formulate the, for the period, uniquely well informed conclusion that the Jains constituted an ancient and distinct religious community which had through its history produced a rich literary corpus. The most well-known representatives of the Madras School were Colin Mackenzie and F.W. Ellis who were joined in their common interest in the Jains by the Abbé J.A. Dubois, author of *Hindu Rites and Customs*. While all three were based in south India they scrutinised the Jains in different ways. Mackenzie was an assiduous collector of manuscripts in the course of his extensive tour throughout the regions but relied on agents and assistants since he lacked any linguistic knowledge. Ellis for his part engaged in intense study of the Tamil textual tradition which enabled him to appreciate the Jain contribution to it, while Dubois's missionary activity and direct experience of the social environment constituted a form of protofieldwork.

The views of these investigators were not formed in isolation and were indebted to several predecessors. A major strength of Orr's contribution is her unravelling of connections between earlier missionaries, in the eighteenth century, most notably Ziegenbalg, Beschi and Coeurdoux and before them in the seventeenth century Nobili, the first European observer to record any perceptions about the Jains of south India. She demonstrates that the Madras School was familiar with the information these particular observers had garnered about the Jains, even if their views were frequently misplaced or ill-judged (e.g. the regular confusion of Jainism with Buddhism and the tendency to subscribe to the prejudices of Brahman informants such as their claim that the Jains had been exterminated by the Śaivas) and coloured by the differing idioms of Christianity to which they subscribed. Unfortunately the unstructured insights about the Jains arrived at by the Madras School, based as they were local informants, exclusively south Indian textual traditions and random observations of missionaries, did not find a responsive

audience within what Orr calls "the emergent English Indological project" based in Calcutta, whose *cognoscenti* were more preoccupied with ancient texts and supposedly grander scholarly subjects such as the Indo-Greeks and Buddhism. Orr's story, while of compelling interest, is ultimately one of frustrated enterprise.

In "Alexander Walker of Bowland's 'Account of the Jeyn': A Starting Point for British Encounters with the Jain Community in Gujarat" Andrea Luithle-Hardenberg discusses a remarkable unpublished and unstudied account of the Jains produced by a Scottish officer in the East India Company, Alexander Walker of Bowland (1764-1831). After a description of Walker's eventful life as a high-ranking soldier and administrator Luithle-Hardenberg moves to a contextualisation of Walker's "Account of the Jeyn" which is a part of a larger manuscript devoted to Maratha history. Walker gained his knowledge of the Jains where he commanded the East India Company forces in Kathiawar and acted as political resident at the court of the Gaekwad court of Baroda. As his period of service in Gujarat was between 1803 and 1809, Walker's "Account" is therefore earlier than the work of the more celebrated James Tod who was active in western India from 1818 to 1823.

The topics with which Walker shows familiarity are remarkable for a European writing at that period and are undoubtedly the result of information received directly from expert members of the Jain community. As well as confirming the identity of the Jains, or "Shravaks", as a discrete religious community independent of the Hindus, he provides a complete list, including length and content, of the constituent texts of the Śvetāmbara  $\bar{a}gama$ , a detailed account of Jain cosmology, material based on interviews with *yatis*, sedentary monks, and information about the inscriptions in the Cintāmaṇi Pārśvanātha temple in Cambay. In his account of the *tīrthaṅkara*s Walker followed his *yati* informants in ascribing historicity to these teachers and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Luithle-Hardenberg moves surefootedly amongst the details of Walker's biography, although there are occasional minor misspellings of place names e.g. "Gallashiels" for Galashiels and "Mid-Lothian" for Midlothian. However, the reference to Walker's *alma mater* being "St. Andrew's in Edinburgh" seems confused. I am indebted to Hannah Kelly (email of November 12 2021) for the information that the Walker of Bowland Papers in the National Library of Scotland contain notes taken in lectures which place Walker firmly in Glasgow University prior to entering the service of the East India Company in 1780. Hannah Kelly is currently a PhD candidate at the University of Liverpool conducting research into the career, literary interests and reading habits of Alexander Walker. See https://hannahkellyliverpool.wordpress.com

accepting that Rṣabha, the first tīrthankara of this time cycle, was the founder of Jainism. However, Luithle-Hardenberg makes the interesting observation that Walker does not place any specific importance on Mahāvīra and that the scholarly focus on the twenty-fourth Jina as founder of the Jain religion may not have emerged until later in the nineteenth century as a result of the publication of the *Kalpa Sūtra*. While there has by and large been a recent consensus that Georg Bühler was the first westerner to draw scholarly attention to the 45 text list of the contents of the Śvetāmbara āgama, Luithle-Hardenberg makes clear that Walker knew about this list more than half a century earlier. Unfortunately his findings remained unpublished and did not influence either subsequent scholarship or, more broadly, the conduct of colonial government. It is to be hoped that Walker's remarkable work will soon be brought to publication and fully revealed as the first significant example of the productive interaction of Jain informants and a sympathetic western observer.

In "James Tod and the Jains" Lawrence A. Babb reworks a fine paper which he published in 2007 on the subject of the best known early British observer of western India, James Tod. Of Scottish parentage although not actually born in Scotland like Mackenzie and Walker,<sup>4</sup> Tod's renowned publications *Annals and Antiquities of Rajasthan* (1829 and 1832) and *Travels in Western India* (1839) remain, despite their frequent romanticising, unparalleled accounts of Rajput tradition. With regard to the Jains, however, Babb shows that for all his admiration of this community and in particular their architecture and respect for scholarship, Tod knew little about their historical or social position and the teachings of their religion. This ignorance is

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Another Scot, James Forbes (1749-1819), recorded his impressions of Gujarat while serving as an East India Company functionary, and although he had no awareness of the Jains as a distinct religious group, he produced a drawing of a Sthānakvāsī monk which is reproduced in CCC. For James Forbes, see Nalini Balbir, "Rencontres indo-britanniques au Gujerat", *Bulletin d'études indiennes* 10 1992: 31-51. One significant absentee from CCC is Alexander Kinloch Forbes, another East India Company officer of Scottish descent who worked in Gujarat. See Aparna Kapadia, "Alexander Forbes and the Making of a Regional History", in Edward Simpson and Aparna Kapadia (ed.), *The Idea of Gujarat: History, Ethnography and Text*, New Delhi: Orient BlackSwan, 2010, pp. 50-65. Forbes was not particularly preoccupied with the Jains, but when writing in 1856 his *Râs Mâlâ*, a "Garland of Chronicles" of Gujarat's medieval past, he made use of one important Jain source mediated to him by a Marwari Jain informant; see Paul Dundas, "Sectarian Confrontation as Theatrical Diversion: Observations on Yaśaścandra's *Mudritakumudacandraprakaraṇa* and the Jain Debate at Aṇahillapaṭṭana" (forthcoming). For the Scottish presence in nineteenth century India, see Alex M. Cain, *The Cornchest for Scotland: Scots in India*, Edinburgh: National Library of Scotland 1986.

certainly surprising given that Tod's assistant and main informant was the Kharatara Gaccha *yati* Jñānacandra,<sup>5</sup> but Babb ascribes it to the Briton's overriding fascination with statecraft as it related to Rajput polity (the Jain trading community served as administrators and financiers) and architecture, areas which did not oblige him to acquire any serious notions about Jainism as a religious tradition.<sup>6</sup> To the extent that he had any view at all of Jainism's position among Indian religions, it was as a debased and debasing (through "idolatry") form of Buddhism.

In "The British 'Discovery' of Jainism in the Nineteenth Century: Scottish Missionaries, the 'Jain Religion' and the Jains of Bombay" Mitch Numark presents a rich analysis of the dynamics of the encounter between a variety of Protestant Christian missionaries with Scottish origins

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> According to Tod, Jñānacandra possessed a copy of a genealogy establishing his pupillary descent from "Hemâchârya", that is the famous twelfth century teacher Hemacandra, by which he gained access to the Kharatara Gaccha library in Pāṭaṇ. Babb points out that this must be an anomaly as Hemacandra had no connection to the Kharatara Gaccha. He goes on to refer to a suggestion of Mahopadhyāy Vinayasāgar that there may have been local phonetic confusion between the initial syllables of "Hemacandra" and "Somacandra", the pre- $d\bar{\imath}k\bar{\imath}a$  name of Jinadattasūri (eleventh-twelfth centuries), a prominent monk of the early Kharatara Gaccha (Somacandra was also the pre- $d\bar{\imath}k\bar{s}\bar{a}$  name of Hemacandra. This explanation is ingenious and may well be correct. Nonetheless, it is unclear why Jinadattasūri's pre-dīksā name should have been used in this context. Hemacandra's gaccha affiliation does not seem to have been a matter of significance in Jain tradition of the "high" medieval period, and prasastis and colopha of his works regularly omit mention of it; nor is it referred to in collections like Prabhācandra's Prabhāvakacarita (c. 1250), which contains the first significant biography of the great teacher. The occasional reference to Hemacandra belonging to the Vajraśākhā of the Kotika Gaccha (see Olle Qvarnström, The Yogaśāstra of Hemacandra, Cambridge Mass. and London: Harvard Oriental Series, 2002, p. 1-2) reflects an attempt to locate him in an ostensibly central monastic lineage to which his teacher Devacandra belonged. Babb refers to Bühler for the view (expressed in 1889 on the basis of a statement by Rājaśekharasūri) that Hemacandra probably belonged to the Pūrnacandra Gaccha. However, this is an otherwise unidentifiable renunciant order and in fact the evidence is that Hemacandra was associated with the Pūrnatalla Gaccha. This order was named after the town of Pūrṇatallaka or Pūrṇatalla in the Jodhpur region and apparently became defunct around the middle of the thirteenth century since records of it are unavailable after that time; see Śivprasād, Śvetāmbar Gacchom kā Samksipt Itihās Sūrat [2009] pp. 911-925. As renunciant numbers in the few surviving Śvetāmbara mūrtipūjaka orders went into decline during the eighteenth and early nineteenth century, the status of earlier defunct gacchas and the exact affiliation of their teachers may have become unclear and eventually negotiable. Conceivably the teacher lineage of the Pūrņatalla Gaccha with its origins in what is now central Rajasthan could have been absorbed within or appropriated by the Kharatara Gaccha, in Jñānacandra's time a numerically very small order but with a marked Rajasthani ethos, and its most celebrated teacher Hemacandra might have retrospectively had a Kharatara connection ascribed to him. With regard to Tod's "Hemâchârya" one may also note the existence of another famous Hemacandra who flourished in Pātan at the same time as his namesake. Hemacandra Maladhārin belonged to the Harşapurīya (later Maladhārīya) Gaccha, a lineage defunct by around the fourteenth century which originated in Rajasthan in the vicinity of Nāgaur.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Tod's enthusiasm for Jain architecture without serious reference to the religious tradition which inspired it and his romantic reinvention of Rajput history suggest that he might be viewed as exemplifying an antiquarian of the type which flourished in Britain in the early decades of the nineteenth century. See Rosemary Hill, *Time's Witness: History in the Age of Romanticism*, Allen Lane 2021.

and the diverse religious communities in Bombay. That expanding conurbation had a considerable Jain population by the middle of the nineteenth century and direct access to its members, and thereby to Jain literature, undoubtedly enabled the Scottish missionaries to become much better informed about the community at an earlier period than has hitherto been realised. It was against this background that the Reverend John Stevenson produced in 1848 his translation of the Kalpa Sūtra, a flawed work no doubt and long since superseded, but nonetheless a remarkable pioneering achievement as the first serious translation of a Jain scripture by a westerner. Numark critiques the view that Hermann Jacobi's 1879 edition of the Kalpa Sūtra represented a major shift in western understanding of Jainism by replacing the inadequate judgement of the Calcutta "Orientalists" such as Colebrooke and H.H. Wilson who saw the Jains in terms of being either Buddhists or Hindus. He argues that early recognition on the part of the Scottish missionaries that the religion of the Jains was an independent entity paved the way for the European reification of the tradition as "Jainism". At the same time, in discussing the emergence of a specific missionary perspective on the Jains Numark makes clear that he is describing "the religious imagination of particular Britons more than Jain ideas of themselves", and the fact the Jains were avowedly anti-Brahman unquestionably predisposed the Presbyterians to differentiate them from Hindus.

The records of the Scottish missionaries Numark has examined contain valuable evidence of how from around the 1830s to the 1860s Jains understood what was involved in expressions such as "Jain *dharm*" and "Jain religion". Numark commendably cautions against anachronistically ascribing to the Bombay Jains a fully consistent awareness of a bounded religious identity but nonetheless concludes that western notions about Jainism, whether articulated by Europeans orientalists or Scottish missionaries, did reflect the objectified manner in which many Jains had conceptualised their religion long before the colonial encounter. Unfortunately these insights were to have little influence upon subsequent academic study of Jainism until the second half of the twentieth century.

In "Defending Jainism against Christianity and Colonialism: Jains and Presbyterian Missionaries in Colonial Gujarat" John E. Cort examines the various modes of Irish Presbyterian missionary proselytising in Gujarat and the manner in which the Jains countered

this. Energetic touring and preaching by missionaries, most notably the Reverend J. Sinclair Stevenson and his wife Margaret, the author of *The Heart of Jainism*, the pervasive influence of English-medium Christian-oriented education and the conversion of several Jain monks who went on to became committed evangelicals were threatening factors which elicited a vigorous response from Jain monastic intellectuals such as Ātmarām and Buddhisāgar. Cort provides for the first time an invaluable assessment of Buddhisāgar's Gujarati polemic against Christian doctrine and what that Śvetāmbara monk regarded as negative western cultural traits. For Cort, Buddhisāgar was an early twentieth century example of a fundamentalist who promoted a standpoint which was both progressive in its anti-colonial stance and conservative in its defence of social and gender hierarchies. He demonstrates that much of Buddhisāgar's argumentation derived from longstanding Jain polemics against Hindu and later Muslim notions of a creator god and were accordingly articulated in terms of the centrality of the processes of karma and rebirth which undercut the need for the intervention of divine agency in human affairs. Other arguments relating to, for example, meat eating and the British association of vegetarianism with weakness and the imperial subjugation of peoples through martial violence reflected Buddhisāgar's rejection of a flawed colonial world of which, for the Jain, the missionaries and the civilisational claims they promoted were prime exemplars.

Cort does not draw any parallels involving Buddhist engagement with Christian clergy during the colonial period in Sri Lanka and the possibly analogous subject of Buddhism's encounter with colonialism is not mentioned by any contributor to CCC. Buddhisāgar on at least one occasion, it seems, challenged the Stevensons to public debate, but the missionaries did not deign to acknowledge him. By and large controversialist exchange between the Jains, who had long experience in this area, and Christians in Gujarat seems to have been conducted solely in print. There was no defining moment of dramatic public encounter comparable to the Buddhist monk Guṇānanda's acclaimed defeat in debate of a Wesleyan opponent at Panadura in 1875 which led to a renewed sense of cultural identity among Sinhalese Buddhists.

In "Owners, Suppliers, Scholars: Jains and Europeans in the Nineteenth Century Search for Manuscripts in Eastern India and Bombay Presidency" Nalini Balbir continues her revelatory work on the transmission of Jain manuscripts to European scholars and the central role of Indian

intermediaries in identifying and supplying documents. The main focus of Balbir's account is Bhagvandas Kevaldas (1850-1900). This remarkable Gujarati, who had no traditional academic title such as pandit or śāstrī and lacked any specific technical expertise, initially acted as agent in India for scholars such as Georg Bühler and Peter Peterson, tracking down manuscripts, facilitating contacts with owners and organising terms of sale. Bhagavandas Kevaldas was eventually to become a dealer of international repute, supplying manuscripts which formed the bases of Jain collections in Britain, France and Italy. Most significantly, he was in regular contact with Ernst Leumann in Strasbourg and provided much of the Śvetāmbara source material with which the Swiss scholar was able to conduct his pioneering researches into Jain literature. Balbir provides excerpts from fascinating correspondence between Bhagvandas and Leumann which shed light on the dynamics of the manuscript trade and makes clear that the Indian agent and the European scholar interacted in epistolary terms of mutual respect. Not all Europeans were ready to acknowledge the contribution of the Indian assistants without whose efforts their philological efforts would have been near impossible, and indeed local agents generally had a subordinate role in the actual production of knowledge compared to  $\dot{sastr\bar{i}s}$ . Nonetheless, Balbir makes clear how in the case of Bhagavandas Kevaldas that impressive figure "featured as a successful businessman and expert in his area [who] lived midway between his patrons, the Europeans, and the Indians".

In "A Shroff Family: From Indigenous Bankers to Cosmopolitans" Gira Shroff Gratier gives an account of how the *śarāf* business community conducted and maintained from the seventeenth to the twentieth century a variety of different and occasionally fraught relationships with local rulers, colonial power, nationalist politics and the demands of a global economy. These traditional bankers were not all Jains, but Jain values seemed to have substantially permeated the commercial conduct of this sector of the South Asian economic world. Shroff Gratier gives particular authority to her account by focussing on her Jain *śarāf* ancestors who moved from Barmer to Surat in the mid-seventeenth century and founded the firm of Sheth Amarchand Laksmichand. She shows how such a Jain family firm was able to maintain its independence and access to financial resources despite the dislocations of frequent migrations and political tensions. Interlocking relationships with other such firms based on shared religious

and cultural values and a reputation for reliability in business dealings enabled the śarāf community to form the bedrock underpinning South Asian economic activity. One of the principal mechanisms for effecting this was the fact that śarāf banking activities were distinguished from those of other financiers by use of a paper-based means of moving money, the huṇḍī, or bill of exchange. This key financial tool is frequently mentioned in historical accounts of Indian commerce, but thanks to Shroff Gratier's commendably clear description this reviewer has for the first time been able to gain an understanding of how it actually functioned.

In "The Life of Premchand Roychand (1831-1906): 'Wisdom above Riches'" Sushil K. Premchand complements Shroff Gratier's contribution with a closely focussed account of a Surati Jain financier and philanthropist whose educational background enabled him to interact and flourish within the British economic imperium while remaining true to the religious values of his community. The author, who is Premchand Roychand's grandson, does not frame his contribution in academic terms but rather provides an affectionate and detailed description of the career of one of the most significant makers of colonial Bombay.

In "The British Courts and the Rise of a Modern Jain Identity in the Nineteenth Century" Hawon Ku discusses a variety of competing legal cases filed by both the Jains and the Ṭhākurs of Palitana in order to establish ownership of the Śvetāmbara pilgrimage site of Mount Śatruñjaya, a dispute which lingered on well into the twentieth century. In the face of British juridicial decisions supporting the local ruler's right to levy a pilgrim tax the Jains boycotted pilgrimage to Śatruñjaya for two years and the matter was only resolved in 1928 after the intervention of the Viceroy. Ku emphasises the decisive role of the famous trust Ānandjī Kalyāṇjī Peḍhī in clarifying Śvetāmbara ownership of Mount Śatruñjaya and so contributing to the mobilisation of Jain identity in the nineteenth century and after within the political and legal constraints imposed by British rule.

In "German and Italian Jain Studies during the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries" Anna Aurelia Esposito engagingly surveys some of the main contributors to what might be described as a "golden age" of Jain philology in Europe. While the achievements of major German-speaking figures such as Weber, Bühler, Jacobi and Leumann are well known, it is

important to recall the contributions of the Italian scholars de Gubernatis, Suali, Belloni Filippi, Pavolini, and Tessitori whose work on texts from the medieval period was undoubtedly pioneering and has retained its value. The initial researches of Pavolini and later Tessitori were prompted by the presence in Florence of a substantial collection of Jain manuscripts which had been deposited there by de Gubernatis. Albrecht Weber's turn towards Jain researches was given a similar impetus by the Königlich Preussischen Akademie's largescale purchase of Śvetāmbara manuscripts which became readily accessible in Berlin. Unfortunately the presence of many Jain manuscripts in London did not foster any comparable British interest in Jain philology during the period Esposito describes. Leumann railed against the obstructive lending policy of some British libraries for refusing to release material which had often been collected by German-speaking scholars employed by the government in India. A.B. Keith, the most prominent British Sanskritist of the first half of the twentieth century, wrote prolifically and with authority on virtually every significant Indological subject with the exception of Jainism, and when called upon to catalogue Jain manuscripts in the British Museum his lack of expertise was evident.

In "In Search of 'Hindu Fiction': The First 'School' of Jain Studies in the U.S." John E. Cort draws attention to the manner in which the first American academic studies of the Jains evinced patterns of cultural engagement which were different from British interaction, mediated as the latter was by an embedded set of power relations. Focussing on Maurice Bloomfield, Helen M. Johnson and W. Norman Brown as representative of an American "school" of Jain studies, Cort draws attention to two ways in which its background was distinctive. Firstly, there was a strong connection with German Indological scholarship which fostered wide ranging studies including subjects such as Prakrit and Jain narrative literature. Secondly, the authority of Brown and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> For the French involvement with the Jains and with Jain learning during the period under discussion, see Nalini Balbir, "French encounters with the Jains and the Paris Jain manuscripts", in Jitendra B. Śāh and Kalpnāben Śeṭh (ed.), *pā. Śrī Kanubhāī Vra. Śeṭh Abhinandan Granth*, Ahmadāvād 2017, pp. 187-202.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> See Nalini Balbir's introductory essay to Ernst Leumann, *An outline of the Āvaśyaka Literature*, Ahmedabad: L.D. Institute, 2010, p. xi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> See Walther Schubring, *Kleine Schriften*, ed. Klaus Bruhn, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1977, pp. 452-453.

Johnson's scholarship could be regarded as deriving from lengthy sojourns in India and regular exchanges with members of the Jain community who were frequently extremely well informed about their religion's textual tradition. This direct experience of Jain tradition can be seen consistently in the annotation to the six volumes of Johnson's well-known translation of Hemacandra's *Triṣaṣṭiśalākāpuruṣacarita* produced over several decades. At the same time, as Cort acknowledges, American scholars accessed a flow of textual information which could only have been expedited through the enabling mechanisms of colonialism.

In "Camaṇakālam: Tamil Jains and Periodisation" Christoph Emmrich contrasts modes of historiographical periodisation introduced by British writers in the nineteenth century with models of time applied to Jain history by Indian scholars of Tamil literature. Emmrich's study (which is based on a previously published paper) can be regarded as supplementing Eli Franco's edited collection *Periodization and Historiography of Indian Philosophy* (Wien: deNobili, 2013) which demonstrates how standard periodisations employed in scholarly treatments of Indian philosophy since the nineteenth century have been historically determined and subject to the preconceptions, often implicit, of modern western scholarship.<sup>11</sup> Such periodisation, Emmrich argues, has led to the occlusion of the Jain community and its literary achievement in the far south of the subcontinent by Tamil Hindu and secular scholars primarily concerned with, in particular, highlighting the unique significance of the Śaiva and Vaiṣṇava bhakti traditions and the achievements of the quintessentially Tamil Cola dynasty.

Volumes of papers originally delivered in conferences produced by a multiplicity of authors often contain a few contributions which disappoint the reader through not being fully thought through or satisfactorily integrated into the collection's declared agenda. With regard to CCC, however, it can be confirmed that evidence of a conference context is not to be found and that ample justice is done to the various topics in hand throughout a coherent and skilfully crafted

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Bloomfield carried out impressive and still valuable work on Jain narrative literature, but he had no direct experience of Jainism. For a discussion of his scholarly perspective, see Rajeshwari Mishka Sinha's 2011 Oxford D. Phil dissertation, "A History of the Transmission of Sanskrit in Britain and America, 1832-1939".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup>A call to reframe radically the hitherto hegemonic model of periodisation in Indian history has been made by Michelguglielmo Torri, "For a New Periodization of Indian History: The History of India as Part of the History of the World", *Studies in History* 30 2014: 89-108.

volume. The overall conclusion to be derived from CCC is, perhaps unsurprisingly, that the role of the Jains during the colonial period (discussed effectively in terms of the Śvetāmbaras only) was ambivalent. The volume makes amply clear how the Jains were active participants in and shapers of the colonial process as well as knowledgeable informants and interlocutors in the western scholarly enterprise. As merchants and bankers operating within a complex indigenous financial system they benefitted more than any other social group (with the possible exception of the Parsis) from the expansion of the colonial economy, playing a major role in moulding and exploiting it. At the same time it must be remembered (and this is a topic only touched on by CCC) that many Jain community leaders and politicians were sceptical about the legitimacy of British authority and its attendant cultural claims and were active participants in the rising of 1857 and, during the first half of the twentieth century, in the independence movement,.

Those familiar with the collection *Jaina Painting and Manuscript Culture: In Memory of Paolo Pianarosa* edited by Julia A.B. Hegewald in 2015 will already be aware of the high production values of the publisher EB-Verlag of Berlin. It is a pleasure to report that the same impressive standards of paper, printing and layout are to be seen in the volume under review. Most notably, sixteen of the valuable illustrations reproduced for technical reasons in black and white through the running text are also printed as full colour plates with total clarity at the conclusion of the volume. Altogether this highly stimulating publication represents a major achievement and is recommended to all with an interest in the Jain community, modern South Asia and business history.

© The Editor. International Journal of Jaina Studies (Online) 2021